

## MINUTES

### TOWN OF NORMAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

May 12, 2020

12:30 p.m.

#### **Members Present**

Zak Boerger, Todd Bugg, Kathy Burgess, Anne Matter, Chris Niebur

#### **Members Absent**

Nancy Armstrong, Bruce Warloe

#### **Others Present**

Taylor Long, Associate Planner; Jason Querciagrossa, Deputy Corporation Counsel; Michael Dubowe, 6 Clinton Place; Amy and Scott Christensen, 2 Broadway Place; Quentin Rabideau, 1202 S Fell Avenue

#### **Call to Order**

Ms. Matter called the meeting to order at 12:30 p.m. noting that there was a quorum of the commission present. As this meeting was conducted virtually over Zoom, Mr. Long summarized proposed etiquette for muting microphones when not speaking and the need for roll call votes for each item on the agenda.

#### **Minutes**

Mr. Bugg moved to approve the minutes of the March 10, 2020 regular meeting. Mr. Niebur seconded the motion. The motion carried 5-0.

#### **CA-20-05-08: Tile Roof Restoration, 6 Clinton Place**

Ms. Matter introduced the application for the restoration of a rear, eastern section of clay tile roof at 6 Clinton Place. Commissioners agreed that the proposed project would result in needed repairs and restore the home's prominent, tile roof.

Ms. Burgess moved to approve the application for the restoration of the clay tile roof at 6 Clinton Place. Mr. Boerger seconded the motion. The motion carried 5-0.

#### **BG-20-05-02: Tile Roof Restoration, 6 Clinton Place**

Commissioners then discussed the applicant's request for Bone Grant funding of the tile roof restoration project. Citing that the applicant would not be permanently removing or adversely altering significant architectural elements of the home, the commissioners agreed to approve the grant request.

The commissioners reviewed the estimates submitted by the applicant – one for a larger scope of work and two for a smaller restoration effort. Mr. Long summarized the estimates, explaining that only one estimate was able to be obtained for the homeowners' full, desired scope of work. Upon review of the estimates and their scopes of work, the commission determined that the applicant had made the requisite, honest effort to obtain two estimates for the larger scope of work. Commissioners agreed to award a grant in the amount of \$3,900.00, half the amount of the estimate for the full, larger tile restoration effort.

Mr. Bugg moved to approve the application for Bone Grant funding of the tile roof restoration project at 6 Clinton Place in the amount of \$3,900.00. Ms. Burgess seconded the motion. The motion carried 5-0.

**CA-19-05-16: Porch Restoration, 605 N School Street (Reapproval)**

This item was discussed later in the meeting after BG-20-05-05.

Ms. Matter introduced the application for the reapproval of CA-19-05-16 for the restoration of the two front porches at 605 N School Street. Mr. Long explained that the one-year approval for this certificate was set to expire before the applicants could complete the second, southern porch's restoration this summer. The commissioners agreed that they all still supported the restoration project as proposed.

Mr. Bugg moved to reapprove the application for the restoration of the two front porches at 605 N School Street. Ms. Burgess seconded the motion. The motion carried 5-0.

**BG-20-05-03: Porch Restoration (Southern), 605 N School Street**

This item was discussed later in the meeting after BG-20-05-05.

Commissioners then discussed the applicants' request for Bone Grant funding for the restoration of 605 N School Street's southernmost front porch. Mr. Long summarized the history of this project and the recent actions taken by the commission in late 2019 to separate the project's funding into two separate grants for each porch's restoration (see the minutes of the commission's November 12, 2019, meeting). Commissioners expressed continued support for the project and its grant funding.

Mr. Boerger moved to approve the application for Bone Grant funding of the restoration of the southernmost front porch at 605 N School Street in an amount not to exceed \$2,568.75, half the amount originally awarded for both front porches' restoration (BG-19-05-03). Mr. Niebur seconded the motion. The motion carried 5-0.

**CA-20-05-09: Tile Roof Replacement, 2 Broadway Place**

Ms. Matter introduced the application for the replacement of deteriorated cement roof tiles at 2 Broadway Place with asphalt shingles. Mr. Long summarized the staff report and the reasons why this and the second application related to this matter, the Certificate of Economic Hardship, were brought to the commission's attention at the same time (see the report for more details).

The applicants and home's owners, Amy and Scott Christensen, summarized their efforts researching the costs of both repairing damaged sections of the roof and completely restoring the roof with identical cement tiles or alternative, similar materials. They then explained their position that the removal of all existing tiles and their replacement with asphalt shingles was the most economically feasible means of preventing further deterioration of the roof and home, generally. The applicants stated that if permitted, they would use CertainTeed asphalt shingles – perhaps ones colored a dark shade of green to mimic the cement, Hawthorn French tiles' original coloring – in place of the unique, deteriorated tiles.

The commissioners expressed appreciation for the applicants' situation and the amount of time and effort spent researching costs for various materials and scopes of work. Commissioners did not weigh any details with regards to the applicant's Certificate of Economic Hardship request while considering the Certificate of Appropriateness application. Reflecting only on the commission's Standards of Review and Design

Guidelines for Certificates of Appropriateness, commissioners agreed that the replacement of the existing, original cement tiles with modern asphalt shingles would not be appropriate.

Mr. Bugg moved to approve the application for the replacement of 2 Broadway Place's cement roof tiles with asphalt shingles. Ms. Burgess seconded the motion. The motion failed 5-0.

**CEH-20-05-01: Certificate of Economic Hardship, Tile Roof Replacement, 2 Broadway Place**

Ms. Matter then introduced the Certificate of Economic Hardship application for the replacement of the cement roof tiles at 2 Broadway Place with asphalt shingles. Mr. Long again summarized the staff report for this project and explained the various grounds on which a homeowner may submit and have such a certificate reviewed by the commission (see the staff report for more details). The applicants then reviewed the estimates they received from qualified contractors detailing the near-\$90,000 costs to repair and/or restore the deteriorating cement tile roof.

Mr. Long then summarized staff's recommendation in support of approving the Certificate of Economic Hardship. In staff's opinion, the costs to either repair or replace the cement tile roof would be overly burdensome for any homeowner, even with potential financial assistance offered through the Bone Grant Program. Further, the requirement to repair or replace the existing roof would very likely deprive the owners of the property of reasonable use of, or a reasonable economic return on, the property.

Based on the materials submitted by the applicants, the commissioners agreed that the Certificate of Economic Hardship should be approved. Mr. Bugg reviewed the Town Zoning Code provision regarding certificates of economic hardship, and asserted his position that the applicants had met the requisite burden of proof to show by a preponderance of the evidence that denial of the certificate would deprive the owners of reasonable use or a reasonable return on the property. The other commissioners all agreed.

Mr. Bugg moved to approve the Certificate of Economic Hardship allowing for the replacement of 2 Broadway Place's cement roof tiles with high-quality, architectural asphalt shingles. Mr. Niebur seconded the motion. The motion carried 5-0.

**CA-20-05-10: Foundation Restoration, 1202 S Fell Avenue**

Ms. Matter introduced the application for the restoration of sections of the brick foundation at 1202 S Fell Avenue. The applicant, Quentin Rabideau, summarized the proposed project that would see a non-historic, cement coating removed from sections of the foundation and various brick and mortar repairs made. Commissioners agreed that the proposed project would result in needed repairs and restore the home's foundation to its original appearance.

Ms. Burgess moved to approve the application for the restoration of the foundation at 1202 S Fell Avenue. Mr. Niebur seconded the motion. The motion carried 5-0.

**BG-20-05-04: Foundation Restoration, 1202 S Fell Avenue**

Commissioners then discussed the applicant's request for Bone Grant funding of the foundation restoration project. Citing that the applicant would not be permanently removing or adversely altering significant architectural elements of the home, the commissioners agreed to approve the grant request.

The commissioners reviewed the estimates submitted by the applicant. Mr. Long summarized the estimates, explaining that two estimates were obtained, but that only one came with a total cost figure known (see the staff report). Mr. Rabideau and Mr. Long summarized the difficulty in finding masons in the area willing to take on residential rehabilitation projects. Upon review of the estimates and their scopes of work, the commission determined that the applicant had made the requisite, honest effort to obtain two estimates for the project. Commissioners agreed to award a grant in the amount of \$2,000.00, half the amount of the full estimate submitted.

Mr. Boerger moved to approve the application for Bone Grant funding of the foundation restoration project at 1202 S Fell Avenue in the amount of \$2,000.00. Mr. Bugg seconded the motion. The motion carried 5-0.

#### **CA-20-05-11: Chimney Restoration, 1202 S Fell Avenue**

Ms. Matter introduced the application for the restoration of the brick chimney at 1202 S Fell Avenue. Mr. Rabideau summarized the proposed work of tuckpointing and repairing various damaged sections of the chimney's bricks and mortar. Commissioners agreed that the project would result in needed repairs and restore the home's chimney to its original state.

Ms. Burgess moved to approve the application for the restoration of the chimney at 1202 S Fell Avenue. Mr. Boerger seconded the motion. The motion carried 4-0. Mr. Bugg was away from his computer for this vote.

#### **BG-20-05-05: Chimney Restoration, 1202 S Fell Avenue**

Commissioners then discussed the applicant's request for Bone Grant funding of the chimney restoration project. Citing that the applicant would not be permanently removing or adversely altering significant architectural elements of the home, the commissioners agreed to approve the grant request.

The commissioners reviewed the one estimate submitted by the applicant for this project. Again, Mr. Rabideau summarized the difficulty in finding masons in the area willing to take on residential rehabilitation projects. In this instance, the commission also determined that the applicant had made the requisite, honest effort to obtain two estimates for this project. Commissioners agreed to award a grant in the amount of \$1,750.00, half the amount of the one estimate submitted.

Mr. Niebur moved to approve the application for Bone Grant funding of the chimney restoration project at 1202 S Fell Avenue in the amount of \$1,750.00. Ms. Burgess seconded the motion. The motion carried 5-0.

### **Other Business**

#### **A. 2020 Heritage Preservation Awards Honorees Selection**

Commissioners and staff discussed how best to proceed with this year's Heritage Preservation Awards, in light of COVID-19 and associated social distancing requirements. Out of a desire to publicly recognize and commend honorees, the commission decided to hold off on selecting honorees for the foreseeable future and wait to recognize distinguished preservation/restoration projects until in-person events of considerable size could be held.

**Adjournment**

Ms. Burgess moved to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Bugg seconded the motion. The meeting was adjourned at 1:25 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "Taylor Long".

Taylor Long  
Associate Planner